

Report to Planning applications committee
Date 7 November 2013
Report of Head of planning services
Subject 13/01442/VC Site of Proposed Residential Care Home Ivy Road Norwich Norfolk

Item
5(2)

SUMMARY

Description:	Minor Material Amendment by variation of condition 2 to allow changes to bays, balconies, entrance, north elevation, depth of the wings facing Bowthorpe Road and size of the east and west wings of previous planning permission 12/01594/F 'Erection of two storey building to provide a 70 bedroom care home (Class C2) with associated access, parking and landscaping.'.
Reason for consideration at Committee:	Objection
Recommendation:	Approve subject to conditions
Ward:	Wensum
Contact Officer:	Lee Cook Senior Planner 01603 212536
Valid Date:	7 September 2013
Applicant:	Caring Homes Group
Agent:	Caring Homes Group

INTRODUCTION

The Site

Location and Context

1. The site is part of the former Bowthorpe School site which, following redevelopment, fronts on to Ivy Road - the new spine road into the site. Opposite the site is a new residential development and further along Ivy Road to the north are community facilities for fire services etc and new buildings for office and business uses at the Henderson Centre.

Constraints

2. The site is allocated in the Replacement Local Plan under Policy HOU11 B16. The tree to the north of the site is protected by a Tree Preservation Order and amendments to the earlier office scheme for this adjoining site were made to avoid the loss of this TPO tree.

Topography

3. The site is relatively level with trees within the site and along its eastern border.

Planning History

Outline planning permission was granted in 2002 for various developments on the overall former school site. The range of developments proposed was subsequently revised and subject of a separate outline application.

Application **09/00035/F** for the erection of a new 60 No. bedroom residential care home with associated landscaping, access and car parking was approved by committee on 23rd April 2009. Application **11/00819/ET** for an extension of time period for commencement of development for previous planning permission 09/00035/F was approved by Planning Applications Committee on 21st July 2011. Application **12/01594/F** for the erection of a two storey building to provide a 70 bedroom care home (Class C2) with associated access, parking and landscaping was approved by Planning Applications Committee on 6th December 2012.

Application **13/00579/VC** for a Minor Material Amendment by variation of condition 2 to allow changes to bays, balconies, depth of the wings facing Bowthorpe Road and size of the west wing living/dining room of planning permission 12/01594/F was approved subject to conditions in line with the 2012 permission in May 2013.

Equality and Diversity Issues

There are no significant equality or diversity issues.

The Proposal

4. Following previous approval of applications 12/01594/F and 13/00579/VC further assessment and site analysis has been undertaken and an issue on space size for residents has been noted. The applicant has asked for parts of the floor layout to be changed to accommodate space requirements now identified which also has a minor impact on the footprint and external appearance of the building.
5. The application seeks minor material amendments by variation of condition 2 of planning permission 12/01594/F to allow changes to bays, balconies, depth of the wings facing Bowthorpe Road, reception area, floor layout above reception and size of living/dining rooms.

Representations Received

6. Advertised on site and in the press. Adjacent and neighbouring properties have been notified in writing. 1 letter of representation has been received citing the issues as summarised in the table below.

Issues Raised	Response
Objects to any increase in the height of the reception roof. Building obscures skyline which is exacerbated by any increase in mass and footprint.	Para 13
There has been opposition to nearby phone mast applications and their heights, with operators claiming required mast heights to clear other surrounding clutter and building masses. Taller building designs will only encourage phone mast operators to plan taller phone masts, further adding to a cluttered skyline.	Noted and is part of assessment on telecoms applications. Future telecoms applications would be determined on their individual merits. Also para 13
The landscape strip along the spine road has defined building distances from the highway and should be protected. The building should be moved east rather than being any closer to the highway.	Paras 11, 12, 19 and 20

Balconies on north-west corner affect existing amenity and will lead to overlooking.	Paras 14 - 16
Object to any light pollution. The care home should have lighting which does not face or give off glare towards the nearby houses. Consideration should be given to minimising the impact of cars shining their headlights onto residential housing.	Paras 17 - 18
Strongly object to any rumble strip, speed bump or other noise creating traffic device. This is not considerate of residents on Ivy Road and will lead to unnecessary noise intrusion.	Paras 17 - 18
There remains an adverse impact on trees within the area.	Para 19
Would much rather look at the natural line of protected beech trees to the east, than the building.	Para 20
Request that comments are read out to the planning committee.	Full copies of representations are available to view via Public Access website and it is practice not to read out comments in full.

ASSESSMENT OF PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

Relevant Planning Policies

National Planning Policy Framework:

- Statement 4 Promoting sustainable transport
- Statement 6 Delivering a wide choice of high quality homes
- Statement 7 Requiring good design
- Statement 8 Promoting healthy communities
- Statement 10 Meeting the challenge of climate change, flooding and coastal change
- Statement 11 Conserving and enhancing the natural environment
- Statement 12 Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

Relevant policies of the adopted Joint Core Strategy for Broadland, Norwich and South Norfolk 2011

- 1 Addressing climate change and protecting environmental assets
- 2 Promoting good design
- 3 Energy and water
- 5 The economy
- 6 Access and transportation
- 7 Supporting communities
- 9 Growth in the Norwich policy area

Relevant saved policies of the adopted City of Norwich Replacement Local Plan 2004

- EP16 Water conservation and sustainable drainage systems
- EP18 High standard of energy efficiency for new development
- EP20 Sustainable use of materials
- EP22 High standard of amenity for residential occupiers

EMP1	Small scale business development
HBE12	High quality of design, with special attention to height, scale, massing and form of development
HOU11 B16	Sites allocated for housing
HOU19	Residential Institutions – criteria
NE8	Tree and habitat protection and enhancement.
NE9	Comprehensive landscaping scheme and tree planting
SR12	Green links
TRA6	Parking standards – maxima
TRA7	Cycle parking standards
TRA8	Servicing provision
TRA12	Travel plans

Supplementary Planning Documents and Guidance

Energy Efficiency (Adopted - December 2006)

Trees and Development (Adopted - October 2007)

Other Material Considerations

Written Ministerial Statement: Planning for Growth March 2011

The Localism Act 2011 – s143 Local Finance Considerations

Development Management Policies Development Plan Document – Pre-submission policies (April 2013).

DM1	Achieving and delivering sustainable development
DM2	Ensuring satisfactory living and working conditions
DM4	Providing for renewable and low carbon energy
DM6	Protecting and enhancing the natural environment
DM7	Trees and development
DM9	Safeguarding Norwich's heritage
DM11	Protecting against environmental hazards
DM12	Ensuring well-planned housing development
DM13	Communal development and multiple occupation
DM28	Encouraging sustainable travel
DM31	Car parking and servicing

Procedural Matters Relating to the Development Plan and the NPPF

7. The Joint Core Strategy and Replacement Local Plan (RLP) have been adopted since the introduction of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act in 2004. With regard to paragraphs 211 and 215-216 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF), both sets of policies have been subjected to a test of compliance with the NPPF. The 2011 JCS policies are considered compliant, but some of the 2004 RLP policies are considered to be compliant with the NPPF with a few exceptions, and as such those particular policies are given lesser weight in the assessment of this application. The Council has also reached submission stage of the emerging new Local Plan policies, and considers most of these to be wholly consistent with the NPPF. .

Principle of Development

Variation of condition – design and layout

8. The application seeks minor material amendments by variation of condition 2 of planning permission 12/01594/F for parts of the floor layout to be changed to accommodate space requirements now identified which also has a minor impact on the footprint and external appearance of the building.

Policy Considerations

9. The proposal should help contribute toward the need for new elderly and dementia care provision in Norwich as identified in policy 7 of the Joint Core Strategy. It has previously been shown that the development, subject to conditions, is an acceptable use on this site. The proposed development accords with other policy and material considerations which arise from this nature of development and with changes in policy since the earlier grant of permission.

Design

Form, Scale and Layout

10. The floor area of the previous scheme was 3342m² and that now proposed increases it by 126m² in total over two floors. Bedroom numbers are also increased to 71. The majority of the bedrooms in the consented scheme were 13.6m². The minimum size of bedrooms has increased to 14m² and a proportion of the rooms are now between 15.5m² and 17m² which assists with occupancy of the building and family accessibility. There are other changes in terms of sizes of kitchen and plant room and living and dining areas. The internal layout has also been tweaked to revise the layout of the reception area, living/dining rooms and floor position of facilities such as activity rooms, family rooms and cinema room.
11. The rationalisation of the footprint has limited impact on the north wing but with the two side wings of the courtyard has the effect of making these slightly wider but shorter in projection. The building is brought closer to Ivy Road in one small part by the width of a wall and the east wing brought closer to the boundary with residential properties by 1 metre. Separation distance of the east wing from the boundary on the east side is shown as averaging 20.9 metres and the service area on the north wing remains at the same distance from the boundary as that approved.
12. Although the central courtyard is narrowed the spaces left around the building are largely unaffected in terms of potential landscaping and in terms of impacts on neighbouring properties. Pushing the building further east would start to have other impacts on adjacent trees and potentially on amenities within the area. The revised footprint provides a suitable balance between design, landscaping and residential amenity.
13. The care home building remains two storeys in height and although the building still has a relatively large footprint, it is still split down in form and elevational treatment to help to reduce the apparent building size and height. Although now again a slightly bigger building than the last approved scheme it is still designed to make best use of the site. The building is also designed with a reasonably low roof pitch and the façade to Ivy Road is split into smaller elements to mirror the domestic scale of other building blocks in the area. No increase in height is shown to the reception roof and following discussions with the agent the lowering of the roof pitch has also sought to ensure that there will not be an overall increase in height of the buildings wings either.

Impact on Living Conditions

Loss of Privacy, Overlooking

14. There has been a reduction/removal of private balconies previously proposed and four of those remaining have been widened to allow access to two rooms rather than one but have also been reduced in depth. The balcony on the east elevation has been removed and there is no amenity impact on the east boundary. Two of the widened balconies are within the courtyard and the others are placed on the north elevation facing the vacant site and fire station and west elevation facing Ivy Road.

15. The previous scheme had deeper balconies on these elevations. That facing Ivy Road is now moved along the building to face the road junction opposite. The other is brought closer to the corner of the building. The layout of residential properties directly opposite this area are angled to the road junction and do not face directly towards Ivy Road those properties that do are themselves at an angle to the position of the new balconies.
16. As with the earlier approved scheme the balconies are some distance from the boundary and properties opposite. They will also now be mostly at an angle to the nearest properties and these suggested changes to balconies should not create any significant amenity impacts on existing residents.

Noise, Lighting and Disturbance

17. The location and principle of design of the access is as previously agreed for this site which is positioned to be at the safest location and to enable development of the site in an appropriate manner. Concerns about vehicle lights illuminating houses opposite and also questioning the use of a rumble strip at the entrance point due to concerns about traffic noise were raised with the previous 2012 application.
18. Given the houses opposite are located behind landscape and access spaces and that change in surface materials can be as successful as any raised feature for the design of road entrances in terms of access and safety this was not considered a significant issue in terms of amenity. A condition is still suggested for the submission of surface materials to ensure a suitable design of such features on site. Light spill from commercial type buildings can sometimes be an issue. To also reduce impacts on amenity and design a condition is still suggested requiring submission of the details and location of external lighting.

Trees and Landscaping

Impact on Trees and Replacement Planting

19. The loss of existing trees within the central areas of the site was discussed at the time of earlier applications and given their nature, position and that an alternative replacement landscape scheme was proposed increasing tree numbers on site, it was decided that the loss of these trees was acceptable. The previous conclusion that the development, requiring a newly detailed landscape scheme thereby complying with Policies NE3, NE8 and NE9 of the Local Plan still stands.
20. The application submission detail still indicates space for several replacement trees along both the Ivy Road and southern boundaries which would provide an avenue effect to site edges and adequately make up for any loss on site in terms of tree and shrub replacement. Other important tree features are being retained and it is recommended that the trees are re-inspected so that any retained trees are in as good a condition as possible. Details of the landscaping and maintenance and tree protection measures/works should be required by condition.

Biodiversity

21. The site remains of limited biodiversity interest, so the main concern would be to ensure that there is no disturbance to breeding birds during construction works. This and the slight possibility that reptiles might be encountered on site during construction works have been adequately addressed in the ecological appraisal. An informative is suggested on this point. A condition for details of site lighting is still proposed which should also encourage the applicants to seek advice on whether the external lighting they propose to use is 'bat friendly' and is not likely to disrupt bat foraging behaviour.
22. From a biodiversity viewpoint, the proposed replacement trees would partially compensate for those to be removed. The proposal also has scope to provide a

wider range of biodiversity enhancements, e.g. bird and bat boxes, that could also add to the residents' enjoyment of the development. Again conditions are suggested for details of biodiversity enhancements to be made on site.

Transport and Access

Car Parking and Cycling Parking, Access and Servicing

23. Parking, servicing design and internal site layout reflect the Council's maximum car parking standards, service routes and cycle parking requirements. Turning shown for a service vehicle is appropriate to both service the building and to access bin areas at the rear of the site. A space for an ambulance bay for the Care home is provided and as these vehicles can often need to wait some considerable period of time outside it is suitably located out of the way of other allocated parking spaces.
24. Cycle parking provision is with covered and secure cycle parking provision for staff and 'Sheffield' type stands close to the entrances for visitors. Refuse storage and collection are next to the staff cycle parking and located in an accessible area next to the parking court. These still appear to make suitable provision for the development.
25. Pedestrian movement minimises conflict between pedestrians and vehicles. The access road and entry point position onto Ivy Road remain as shown on the previous approval and in transport terms there is no objection to the principle of development. Conditions are suggested for provision of parking and servicing requirements and for hard surface materials within this access space.

Travel Plan

26. The Local Plan policy also requires a travel plan, but given the relatively low transport demand of the site a full travel plan is not appropriate in this instance. A condition for the provision of a Travel Information Plan in line with Council guidance is still considered to be sufficient.

Environmental Issues

Site Contamination and Remediation

27. It was previously noted that there are some elevated levels of contaminants in some parts of the site and made ground on the site is to be removed and levels made up with imported material. Therefore conditions are recommended for remediation being carried out and also standard conditions to ensure site contamination monitoring and certification of materials given the sensitive end use of the site.

Noise, Plant and Machinery

28. In order to ensure that extract flues, ventilation and any external plant/machinery do not become sources of nuisance conditions are recommended to require approval of suitable details for their installation.

Archaeology

29. The Historic Environment Service identified some areas of archaeological interest in the wider area. They therefore requested an informative note on any permission to advise the applicant that there were possible flint and chalk workings in this area.

Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy

30. The commitment to use improved building insulation to walls and floors and using high efficiency heating systems to reduce energy demand remains in place as does building orientation and layout of spaces to increase solar gain and natural daylight.
31. The preferred option for decentralised renewable or low-carbon energy production is suggested as being a mini CHP unit with combined exhaust heat and electricity generated being sent into the building to share heating load and supplement the electricity supply. The system is suggested as providing in excess of 10% energy

requirement and would aim to meet a 19.76% energy production on site. A condition is suggested to cover energy requirements for the development.

Water Conservation

32. As previously it would appear that the development is capable of meeting requirements for both energy and water as required by JCS policy 3.

Local Finance Considerations

33. Under section 143 of the Localism Act the council is required to consider the impact of new development proposals on local finance. The proposal would, if approved, have an impact on Council Tax revenue for the Council but in this instance would deliver a scheme which at present is exempt from payment. It also remains important to take into account other material considerations in assessing the merits of proposals, which in this case include the provision of communal residential care development to serve the locality, impacts on residential amenities, design, transport and environmental considerations, amongst other things.
34. The scheme would also be assessed against community infrastructure levy (CIL) requirements and it is noted that the scheme increases the footprint by over 100m² and this element becomes liable. However current CIL liability would be £0 per m².

Conclusions

35. The proposal should help contribute toward the need for new elderly and dementia care provision in Norwich as identified in policy 7 of the Joint Core Strategy. It has been shown that the development, subject to conditions, is an acceptable use on this site. The proposed development also accords with other policy and material considerations which arise from this nature of development and with changes in policy since the previous grant of permission first in 2007, 2009, 2011 and recently in 2012/13.
36. The development would relate well to and builds on the ongoing regeneration and character of the surrounding area. The care home building would be set back from the Ivy Road frontage. The set back from the roadway, layout and landscaping will still provide a reasonable openness to site. The proposed changes are minor in design impact and should not make any significant changes to the final appearance or impression of the building or impact on issues such as amenity, highway safety, servicing etc and as such the amended scheme is considered to be acceptable.
37. The applicant has confirmed that there are no other material changes and documents submitted with the 2012 application remain relevant. As such those conditions imposed on the previous permission are to be replicated on this new permission for the site to ensure that matters requiring further detail or control remain in force.

RECOMMENDATIONS

To approve application No 13/01442/VC site of proposed residential care home Ivy Road Norwich and grant planning permission, subject to the following conditions:-

1. Commencement of development
2. Development in accordance with drawings and details listed
3. Details of sample materials; external lighting; joinery (windows and doors)
4. Details of access road, site links, car parking, cycle storage, bin stores
5. Parking and service areas available before use commences
6. Details of Travel Plan
7. Details of landscaping, biodiversity enhancements, planting, boundary treatment, walls and fences and site treatment works. Landscape maintenance
8. Details tree works and protection
9. Implementation of tree works and protection
10. Areas to be undisturbed within tree protection areas
11. Details, installation and maintenance to ensure that at least 10% of its energy requirement is achieved through decentralised and renewable or low-carbon sources
12. Details of water efficiency measures
13. Submission of contamination verification plan
14. Cessation of site works if further contamination found
15. Control of imported topsoil
16. Details of plant and machinery
17. Details of fume and flue
18. Provision of fire hydrant
19. Restriction on use to care home only


Article 31(1) (cc) Statement

The local planning authority in making its decision has had due regard to paragraph 187 of the National Planning Policy Framework as well as the development plan, national planning policy and other material considerations, following negotiations with the applicant and subsequent amendments at the earlier application and pre-application stages the application has been approved subject to appropriate conditions and for the reasons outlined within the committee report for the application.

Informatives

1. Historic Environment Service advise that there are possible flint and chalk workings in this area.
2. Work to have regard to wildlife and bird breeding season (1 March – 31 August)
3. Considerate constructors' scheme (to avoid noise and disturbance)
4. Vehicle crossovers for site access road will be expected to meet the Highway Authority's specification and to be constructed at the applicant's cost





INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

REAL TIME SAFETY RISK ASSESSMENT CONSEQUENCE TABLE

	Significant	Minor	Significant	Minor	Significant
Almost Certain 5	5	2	5	2	5
Likely 4	4	2	4	2	4
Possible 3	3	2	3	2	3
Unlikely 2	2	2	2	2	2
Rare 1	1	2	1	2	1

No Health and Safety Risks identified on this drawing

D Footprint outlined to reflect current layout.
C Non-path related.
B previously approved building footprint and dimensions added.
A Path path added.

Revised: 01/02/12
Drawn: 01/02/12
Rev: 01/02/12
Date: 01/02/12

REVISION

NO	DESCRIPTION	DATE
1	As Issued	01/02/12

STAMP

PLANNING

PROJECT STATUS

DESIGN

DRAWING TITLE

PROPOSED SITE PLAN

PROJECT

PROPOSED RESIDENTIAL CARE HOME
at IVY ROAD, NORWICH
for CARING HOMES

DATE CREATED

01/02/12

DESIGNER

RMcl

SCALE @ A1

1 : 200

DRAWING NUMBER

4926 D SP002

REVISION

D

oliver + robb architects
Pineapple Drive, Dunfermline
KY11 8UH
T: 01383 621621
W: www.oliverandrobb.co.uk

Members: Brian A. Robb, David M. Todd, Campbell G. Reid



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

HEALTH AND SAFETY RISK ASSESSMENT / CONSEQUENCE TABLE		Consequence			
		Insignificant	Minor	Substantial	Catastrophic
Likelihood	Almost Certain (5)	1	2	3	4
	Likely (4)	2	3	4	5
	Occasional (3)	3	4	5	6
	Unlikely (2)	4	5	6	7
Risk		1	2	3	4

No Health and Safety Risks identified on this drawing



1 (E) Front Elevation (North)
1 : 100

Notes

Movement joints generally to be concealed behind RWPs where possible. Refer to Structural Engineers drawings for locations

External Lighting including bollards/uplighters etc as per Service Engineers drawings

Refer to Window Schedule drawings for all window opening sizes, glazing notes etc.

Refer to External Door Schedule drawings for door sizing, notes etc

The location of all other roof vents and extracts (i.e kitchen, plant room, laundry, lift shaft and combined ensuite extracts/vents etc) to be confirmed in due course. All extracts/vents are to be fully coordinated between the Service Engineer, Contractor and Architect to ensure that the locations are as discreet as possible and comply with current Building Regulations

- Finishes Key**
- Roof Finishes**
- 1 Slate Grey Redland mini stone/old plain concrete tile
- External Wall Finishes**
- 2 Sandstone weathered buff facing brick
 - 4 Horizontal Marley Cordral Weatherboard 502 Beige
 - 5 Horizontal Marley Cordral Weatherboard S16 Cevennes Green
- Flat Roofing**
Samfri (coloured grey)
- Doors**
White uPVC
- Curtain Walling**
(including the main entrance door. Note all curtain walling is prefabricated with reference CW on the drawings)
All curtain walling to be painted with powder coated aluminium and coloured light grey. RAL colour to be by the Architect. Opening vents within screen as indicated on elevations. Prefabricated powder coated aluminium slip clips to all curtain wall panels.
- Windows**
White uPVC
- Fascias and Soffits**
White uPVC
- Gutters and Downpipes**
Black uPVC
- Window Cills**
Reconstituted Stone Cills
- Balustrade Juliet Balcony**
Glass with stainless steel fixings/supports and treated timber hand rail



2 (E) Side Elevation (West)
1 : 100

E	Roof pitch reduced to 12° slope. Ridge height reduced 400mm. Windows to be added. Extracts reduced in size. Additional vents to be added. (Refer to Structural Engineers drawings for locations)	RMd	28/10/13
D	Architect's drawing of the building.	RMd	28/10/13
C	Revisions shown in bold.	RMd	28/10/13
B	Revisions shown in bold.	RMd	28/10/13
A	Revisions shown in bold.	RMd	28/10/13
Revisions updated to reflect current layout. Finishes key updated. Materials selected.			
Rev	Description	Auth	Date
1	Issued for construction	RMd	28/10/13

REVISION

STAMP
PLANNING

PROJECT STATUS
DESIGN

DRAWING TITLE
PROPOSED NORTH AND WEST ELEVATION

PROJECT
PROPOSED RESIDENTIAL CARE HOME at IVY ROAD, NORWICH for CARING HOMES

DATE CREATED	DESIGNER	SCALE @ A1
31/01/13	RMd	1 : 100

DRAWING NUMBER	REVISION
4926 D EL001	E



oliver + robb architects

Pineapple Drive, Dunfermline
KY11 5UH
T: 01383 621621
W: www.oliverandrobb.co.uk

Members: Brian A. Robb, David M. Threlk, Campbell G. Reid